SOME LINGUSITIC DIFFICULTIES FACING DARI SPEAKERS LEARNING PASHTO

M. ALAM MIRAN
The University of Texas at Austin
July, 1974

The Occasional Papers are part of a subscription series distributed by the Afghanistan Council of The Asia Society. To qualify for publication, papers must represent solid original research related to the humanities and the social sciences. Translations of such materials from Dari or Pashto will also be considered. Please address all inquiries to the Council at 112 East 64th Street, New York, N.Y. 10021.

Views expressed in Afghanistan Council publications reflect those of the authors and not the Afghanistan Council or The Asia Society.

Subscription information: for Newsletters, Occasional & Special Papers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>U.S. &amp; Canada</th>
<th>Overseas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annual rates</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
<td>$6.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per issue</td>
<td>$1.25</td>
<td>$1.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A list of past publications is available upon request.
INTRODUCTION

Afghanistan is a multi-lingual country. Among some 20-35 languages which are spoken in the country, Pashto and Dari (Afghan Standard Persian, mainly Kabuli dialect) are the two official and national languages. Pashto is spoken by about sixteen million people, including more than half of the population of Afghanistan and about seven million people of Pashtunistan (previously the northwest frontier of India, and now Pakistan).

There are two main dialects of Pashto: the "Southwestern" (Kandahari) and the "Eastern" (Peshawari). The former is spoken in Kandahar, Greshk, Farah, and other parts of the Southwest portion of the country, and is considered the "standard" dialect. The Kandahar version of this dialect is in use among the educated people. Because its phonemic system corresponds to the prevailing orthography, the Kandahar dialect has great prestige among the Afghan educated people (Penzl, Part II.4).

Dari is spoken by more than eight million people in most parts of the country, both in rural areas and by a majority of the population of the towns and urban areas. Dari is functioning as a lingua franca, that is, more than eighty percent of the total population are speaking Dari as a native, second, or third language. There are several dialectal variations in Dari--those of Kabuli, Herati, Huzaragi, Tajiki, and several others. The Kabuli dialect is spoken by the educated people and is considered the "standard" dialect.
Pashto and Dari are both Indo-Iranian languages; however, their close historical relationship goes too far back in time to make either language intelligible to the speaker of the other. The overall similarities, however, are helpful to the speakers of Dari learning Pashto or vice-versa. The similarities may be phonological, morphological, and syntactical.

Pashto has been a required subject for Dari-speaking children in Afghan schools since 1936. Since then, Pashto textbooks have been prepared for use in the schools. To the best of my knowledge, however, no systematic attempt has been made to identify the problems of Dari learners of Pashto. Nor has there been preparation of teaching materials with particular attention to an emphasis on solutions for these problems.

A first and major step in identifying the problems likely to be encountered by the learners of a foreign language is a contrastive study of the foreign language and/or second language and the native language. Such studies have become more and more common in recent years (mostly in situations where one of the two languages is English). It was felt that there is a need for a contrastive study of these two languages. This thesis is one part of such a study, concentrating primarily on morphology, though phonology is also discussed in a sketchy manner. It is to be hoped that other investigators will continue the work here started, covering areas not adequately discussed.
Dr. M. Esmael Burhan in his study of 1972 found that no studies had been done to that time and that such studies are still needed. He asserts, "To date, unfortunately, no systematic investigations have been conducted in the teaching of Dari and Pashtu as second languages. Except for M.A. Miran's work, no adequate description of the two languages has been attempted in an effort to provide language teachers with systematic guidelines regarding similarities and differences of the two languages" (page 115).

The original version of this work comprised the author's thesis for completion of the Master of Arts degree at The University of Texas in August, 1969. The portion which is contained in this publication is the original chapters I and IV. The original introduction has been modified with some additional and more recent information. Basically, chapters II and III of the earlier version contain linguistic descriptions of Pashto and Dari, respectively. Although the analysis of the two languages was the author's own work, the description of Pashto in chapter II was based primarily on Professor Herbert Penzl's A Grammar of Pashto: A Descriptive Study of the Dialect of Kandahar (1955). The primary sources of information for chapter III were Dr. A.G. Farhadi's Le Persan Parlé en Afghanistan Grammaire du Kaboli (Paris, 1955) and J. Wei, "Dialectal Differences Between Three Standard Varieties of Persian: Teheran, Kabul, and Tajik" (Center for Applied Linguistics of the Modern Language Association of America, Washington, D.C. 1962).
The first portion of this publication presents the principal differences between the sound systems of Pashto and Dari. The second portion presents some of the major differences between the morphological structures of the two languages. These differences identify the major difficulties which confront the Dari speaker in mastering Pashto phonology and morphology.

**Transliteration of Dari and Pashto**

This transliteration is based on the Roman alphabet usage of several scholars in their work in Dari and Pashto. The main problems that confront us here are the vowel system of Dari and Pashto and the Pashto extra phonemes which neither English nor Dari have. The diacritical marks indicate the length of vowels and different phonemes in Pashto. The closest possible pronunciation in English is given; otherwise, the corresponding space in the column is left blank.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONSONANTS</th>
<th>Phonetic Transcription</th>
<th>Roman Alphabet Transliteration</th>
<th>English Equivalent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stops</strong></td>
<td>/p/</td>
<td>Pashto p</td>
<td>pickle, popcorn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/b/</td>
<td>Dari b</td>
<td>Bob, Bible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/t/</td>
<td></td>
<td>table, boat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/d/</td>
<td></td>
<td>dental, food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/t/</td>
<td></td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/d/</td>
<td></td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/k/</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kabul, cake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/g/</td>
<td></td>
<td>gap, google</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/q/</td>
<td></td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Africates</strong></td>
<td>/t/</td>
<td>ts</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/t/</td>
<td>dz</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/c/</td>
<td>ch</td>
<td>church, bench</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/j/</td>
<td>j</td>
<td>job, judge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fricatives</strong></td>
<td>/f/</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>foot, fifty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/s/</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>see, sister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/z/</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>zero, size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ʃ/</td>
<td>sh</td>
<td>should, fish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ʒ/</td>
<td>zh</td>
<td>pleasure, garage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ɕ/</td>
<td>s (ɕ)</td>
<td>German ch (bach)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ʑ/</td>
<td>z (ʑ)</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/x/</td>
<td>kh</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ɣ/</td>
<td>gh</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/h/</td>
<td>h</td>
<td>hello, behold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nasals</strong></td>
<td>/m/</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>middle, moment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/n/</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>need, noon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ŋ/</td>
<td>ŋ</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Liquids</strong></td>
<td>/l/</td>
<td>l</td>
<td>law, middle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/r/</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>rural, bribe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/ɾ/</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>no equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Semivowels</strong></td>
<td>/w/</td>
<td>w</td>
<td>window, vowel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/y/</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>yellow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## VOWELS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phonetic Transcription</th>
<th>Pashto</th>
<th>Dari</th>
<th>English Equivalent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>High</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/i/</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>beat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/u/</td>
<td>u</td>
<td>u</td>
<td>pool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mid</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/e/</td>
<td>ē</td>
<td>ē</td>
<td>let</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ey/*</td>
<td>e</td>
<td>e</td>
<td>lay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/o/</td>
<td>o</td>
<td>o</td>
<td>pull</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ow/*</td>
<td>ə</td>
<td>ə</td>
<td>coat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ə/</td>
<td>u</td>
<td></td>
<td>but</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Low</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/æ/</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>Afghanistan, Kandahar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/a/</td>
<td>ā</td>
<td>ā</td>
<td>scott</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The long vowels /e/ and /o/, as in English lay and coat have been treated as diphthongs /ey/ and /ow/, respectively. See the note for Part I, #2.*
### Table 1. Pashto and Dari Consonants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bilabial</th>
<th>Labiodental</th>
<th>Dental</th>
<th>Alveolar</th>
<th>Velar</th>
<th>Postvelar</th>
<th>Glottal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stops</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voiceless</td>
<td>F F</td>
<td>t t</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>K K</td>
<td>q</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voiced</td>
<td>b b</td>
<td>d d</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>g g</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affricates</td>
<td>Voiceless</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c c</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Voiced</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>J J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fricatives</td>
<td>Voiceless</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>f s s</td>
<td>x x</td>
<td>h</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Voiced</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>z z ž ž ž</td>
<td>g g</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasals</td>
<td>m m</td>
<td>n n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liquids</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lateral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>l l</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trill</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>r r r</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semivowels</td>
<td></td>
<td>w w</td>
<td></td>
<td>y y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P = Pashto  
D = Dari

A dot under a letter indicates a retroflex articulation.

### Table 2. Pashto and Dari Vowels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Front</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Back</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
<td>P D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>i i</td>
<td>u u</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid</td>
<td>e e</td>
<td>o o</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>æ æ</td>
<td>s s</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART I: THE PHONOLOGY OF PASHTO AND DARI

Introduction

This section consists of two parts. In the first part, the phonemes of Pashto and Dari will be listed, and the major phonotactic facts presented. In the second part, the chief differences between the two phonological systems will be discussed briefly. The treatment of all of these subjects, however, will be in outline form, and quite brief, since the central concern of this thesis is the morphology of the two languages. The information on phonology will be given as background only. More detailed descriptions will be found in the works listed in the bibliography. Only a few of the allophonic differences will be noted.
The Phonology of Pashto

Pashto shows considerable dialectal variation. The following description is based on the (southwestern) Kandahar dialect, which is generally considered the "standard" dialect.

1. Pashto Consonants

There are some consonants in Pashto which do not occur in the speech of monolingual speakers, but only in the formal speech of the educated people, who are bilingual in Pashto and Dari. These are considered "elegant" phonemes, and consist of /f/ (ف) voiceless labiodental fricative; /q/ (ق) voiceless velar stops; /ʔ/ (٪) glottal stop; /h/ pharyngeal. They are not part of the spoken Pashto of Kandahar, and so will not appear in the following description of Pashto phonemes.

a. Stops

/p/, /b/ voiceless and voiced bilabial stops: [p'] and [b].
/t/, /d/ voiceless and voiced dental stops: [t'], [d].
/t'/, /d'/ voiceless and voiced retroflex prepalatal stops: [t'], [d'].
/k/, /g/ voiceless and voiced velar stops: [k'], [g'] before the front vowels, [k'], [g'] elsewhere.

b. Affricates

/ʃ/, /ʒ/ voiceless and voiced alveolar affricates: [ts], [dz].
/c/, /ʃ/ voiceless and voiced prepalatal affricates: [tʃ], [dʒ].

[ŋ].

c. Fricatives

/s/, /z/ voiceless and voiced dental fricatives: [s], [z].

/ʃ/, /z/ voiceless and voiced alveolar fricatives: [ʃ], [ʒ].

/s/, /z/ voiceless and voiced retroflex prepalatal fricatives:

[x], [ɣ].

/ʃ/, /ʒ/ voiceless and voiced post-velar fricatives: [ʃ], [ʒ].

/h/ voiceless glottal fricative: [h].

d. Nasals

/m/ bilabial nasal: [m].

/n/ dental nasal [n]

/ŋ/ retroflex prepalatal nasal: [ŋ].

e. Liquids

/l/ alveolar lateral: [l].

/r/ alveolar trill: [r].

/r/ retroflex prepalatal trill: [ɾ].

f. Semivowels

/w/ bilabial high back rounded semivowel: [w].

/y/ prepalatal high front semivowel: [y].
2. **Pashto Consonant Clusters**

Consonant clusters in general occur in all positions. Initial clusters are very common, a fact which is of special interest to us because of the absence of such clusters in Dari. For a list of the initial consonant clusters, see Penzl, p. 16.

3. **Pashto Vowels**
   a. **Front Vowels** (all unrounded)
      
      /i/ high front: [i].
      
      /e/ mid front: [e] occurs in medial and final positions, but not initially.
      
      /a/ low front: [a].
   
   b. **Central Vowel**: /a/
      
      [a] occurs in medial and final positions, but not initially.
   
   c. **Back Vowels**
      
      /u/ high back rounded: [u].
      
      /o/ mid back rounded: [o].
      
      /a/ low back unrounded: [a].

4. **Pashto Diphthongs**

In Pashto, /a, e, o, u, a/ combine with /y/, and /a, e, o, a/ combine with /w/, to form the following diphthongs: /ay, ey, oy, uy, ay, aw, ow, aw/. 
5. Pashto Suprasegmental Phonemes

a. Stress

There are three phonemes of stress: primary /\*/, secondary //\*//, and weak //\~\*, the latter usually left unmarked in transcription. Each word in isolation has one primary stress, but the place of stress is not predictable in polysyllabic words.

b. Pitch

There are four pitches: extra high //4//, high //3//, medium //2//, and low //1//. //4// occurs very rarely. The high pitch //3// generally occurs on the last primary stress within the phonological phrase.

c. Juncture

Pauses result in several types of junctures: close //./, internal open //+/, sustain //||/, rise //||/, and fall //#//. In phonemic transcription, //+/ is represented by space, and close juncture by the absence of space between two segmental phonemes.

The Phonology of Dari

There are dialectal variations in Dari too. The present description is based on the Kabuli dialect, which is considered the "standard" dialect. The two glottal phonemes //?//, //h// will not appear in the following description of Dari phonemes because they do not occur in the speech of the Dari speakers in Kabul. They are only
represented in the written form of Dari, and most such cases (especially in the case of */ʕ/ (c)) represent Arabic borrowings.

1. **Dari Consonants**

   a. **Stops**

      /p/, /b/ voiceless and voiced bilabial stops: [p'], [b].
      /t/, /d/ voiceless and voiced dental stops: [t'], [d].
      /k/, /g/ voiceless and voiced velar stops: [k'], [g'] before front vowels; [k'], [g] elsewhere.

      /q/ voiceless post-velar stop: [q]

      This phoneme does not have a voiced counterpart.

   b. **Affricates**

      /c/, /j/ voiceless and voiced prepalatal affricates: [tʃ], [dʒ].

   c. **Fricatives**

      /f/ voiceless labiodental fricative: [f].

      It does not have a voiced counterpart.

      /s/, /z/ voiceless and voiced dental fricatives: [s], [z].

      /ʃ/, /ʒ/ voiceless and voiced alveolar fricatives: [ʃ], [ʒ].

      /x/, /ɣ/ voiceless and voiced postvelar fricatives: [x], [ɣ].

   d. **Nasals**

      /m/ bilabial nasal: [M] (voiceless) after voiceless phonemes and before /-l/; [m] elsewhere.
/n/ dental nasal: [N] (voiceless) before /k, g, q/; [n] elsewhere.

e. **Liquids**

/l/ alveolar lateral: [l] ("dark l") in syllable final position; [L] (voiceless) before /t, k, g/; [l] elsewhere.

/r/ alveolar trill: [ɾ] (lateral) in intervocalic position; [R] (voiceless) in syllable final position; [r] elsewhere.

f. **Semivowels**

/w/ bilabial high back semivowel: [w].

/y/ prepalatal high front semivowel: [y].

2. **Dari Consonant Clusters**

Dari does not have initial consonant clusters. There are, however, numerous hetero-syllabic clusters of two consonants each in the medial and final positions.

3. **Dari Vowels**

a. **Front Vowels** (all unrounded)

/i/ high front: [i]

/e/ mid front: [e]

/æ/ low front: [ə].

b. **Back vowels**

/u/ high back rounded: [u].
/o/ mid back rounded: [o].
/a/ low back somewhat front unrounded: [a].

4. Dari Diphthongs

/æ, e, u, a/ combine with /y/ and /æ, o/ combine with /w/
to form the following diphthongs: /æy, ey, uy, ay, æw, ow/.

1.10 Dari Suprasegmental Phonemes

a. Stress

There are three phonemes of stress: primary '/', secondary
'/' and weak '/', the latter usually left unmarked. The primary stress
usually regularly falls on the last syllable of a noun, adjective,
and pronoun.

b. Pitch

There are four pitches: extra high '/4/', high '/3/', medium '/2/',
and low '/1/'. '/4/' occurs very rarely. The high pitch '/3/' generally
falls on the last primary stress in the phonological phrase.

c. Juncture

There are five junctures: close '/>. internal-open '+/',
sustain '/|/', rise '/||/' and fall '/#/'. '+/' is generally indicated by
space in phonemic transcription; and close juncture by the absence of
space between two symbols representing segmental phonemes.
Major Differences Between the
Phonological Systems of Pashto and Dari

A comparison of the phonological systems of the two languages, as outlined in the preceding sections, indicates some of the major differences between the two systems, and thus some of the problems a speaker of Dari is likely to encounter in pronouncing Pashto. In the following paragraphs, the letter P indicates Pashto, and D stands for Dari.

1. Problems Involving Individual Phonemes

(1) There are two Pashto phonemes for which there are no corresponding phonemes in the corresponding points in the Dari system. These are P/a/ and P/h/. Dari speakers usually substitute /ɛ/, /æ/ or /o/ for P/a/. The choice of one or the other of these substitutes is not predictable. Thus, P/towpāk/ 'gun' is reproduced as /towpāk/; /ʃɒm/ 'I go' as /zɒm/; /ʃɒkɒ/ 'because' as /zékɒ/. P/h/ usually disappears in the pronunciation of the Dari speaker, e.g., P/welik/ 'boy' is reproduced as /welik/, P/pōwh/ 'school' as /pōwh/.

(2) In a number of instances, a Pashto phoneme with no counterpart in Dari is merged with one which does have a counterpart in the Dari system:

(a) The prepalatal retroflex P/t d n/ merge with their nonretroflex dental counterparts /t d n/. Thus, a Dari speaker tends to reproduce
/towl/ 'all,' /déyr/ 'much,' /mənumə/ 'apple' as /towl/, /déyr/, /mənumə/, respectively.

(b) The prepalatal retroflex P/s ẑ/ are merged with alveolar /s ẑ/. Thus, a Dari speaker tends to mispronounce /šār/ 'city,' /kéyzi/ 'be done' as /šār/ and /kéyzi/ respectively.

(c) The alveolar affricates P/s ẑ/ are merged with prepalatal affricates /s ʃ/. A Dari speaker will tend to replace /ʃadər/ 'scarf,' and /wriz/ 'rice' with /cadər/ and /woriz/, respectively.

The pattern of substitutions in the above cases has two features in common: (a) The manner of articulation remains the same in each case, while the place of articulation changes. (b) In each case the Pashto phoneme with no counterpart in Dari is merged with a phoneme that does have a Dari counterpart and is in the nearest column (i.e., having the nearest place of articulation). This is always the nearest column to the left. This pattern is quite obvious in the substitution of /s ẑ/, rather than the expected /s, z/, for P/s, ẑ/.

(3) In one case, there are two alternate substitutes for a Pashto phoneme. The retroflex P/r/ is replaced either with /r/ or, most often, with /l/. Thus, a Dari speaker tends to say /lündəründ/ for P/ründ/ 'blind.' Again, here we can see that the place of articulation changes. As to the manner of articulation, it remains basically the same, in that both /r/ and /l/ are "liquids" (or "linguals"), though they belong to two sub-categories within the broad "liquid"
category. It is interesting, however, that the lateral /l/ is used in place of /r/ more often than the apparently "closer" trill /r/. This confusion is apparently due to the close phonetic features of /r r l/, as Penzl has indicated. (See Penzl, p. 25.)

(4) The alveolar affricate pair P/ʃ ʃ/ presents a combination of the features present in (2) and (3). Sometimes, they are merged with /c j/, which are the only other affricates in Pashto (and Dari), that is, the only other phonemes with the same manner of articulation. Thus, a Dari speaker tends to say /cá/, and /jáy/ for P/ʃá/ 'well' and /ʃáy/ 'place' respectively. In these examples, the substitution follows the pattern under (2), with the minor difference that these phonemes merge with the closest phonemes to their right. This is not surprising, however, because there are no phonemes to their left.

At other times, however, the alveolar affricates /ʃ ʃ/ are replaced with the dental fricatives /s z/, as in P/sarəndyʃ/ 'boy scout' and P/wrəʃ/ 'day' which will be pronounced as /sarəndyʃ/ and /wɔrəz/, respectively. In these and similar cases, both the place and the manner of articulation are changed. This is partially similar to the situation described in (3). The difference is that in that situation the manner of articulation remained basically the same. Once again, the change in the manner of articulation could not be exactly the same as in the case of those under (2), since there are no affricates to the left of /ʃ ʃ/, so that /s z/ are the "closest"
phonemes to them in this respect. It seems that the manner of articulation has priority in sound substitution.

2. Problems Involving the Distribution of Phonemes

(1) P stressed and unstressed /əy/ containing the vowel /ə/, which has no equivalent in Dari, are difficult for Dari speakers. Thus, /mɒlgɜəy/ 'friend' is reproduced as /mɒlgɜəy/, and P/spəy/ 'bitch' as /sepəy/. These substitutions actually represent two problems: (a) the vowel /ə/ is not familiar to the speaker of Dari. (b) The Dari speaker is accustomed to maintaining the vowel distinctions of Dari in both stressed and unstressed syllables.

(2) The major problem in the area of the distribution of phonemes is caused by the presence of initial consonant clusters in Pashto, and their absence in Dari. These are very difficult for the speaker of Dari, who mispronounces them according to the following patterns:

1. P./Cw>/Cow:/ /gəwə/ 'cow'>/gəwə/
2. P/CC>/eC~CeC:/ /spə/ 'night'>/eʃpə~sepə/.

(3) The stress usually occurs in the final position in Dari substantives but its place is unpredictable in Pashto; and this causes difficulty for Dari-speaking students.

(4) Certain sequences of Pashto phonemes are difficult for Dari speakers because of a combination of factors. Perhaps the most
important of these are initial consonant clusters containing the retroflex P/r/. Such clusters are difficult both because initial consonant clusters do not exist in Dari, and because Dari does not have retroflex phonemes. Thus, P/Cr>/CVl/; e.g., /tral/ 'going'> /talal/.

Note that this example contains a third difficulty in the phoneme P/o/, for which /e/ is substituted here.
NOTES FOR PART I

Although generally I follow Penzl's analysis, some of my symbols differ from his. I use the symbol for the retroflex phonemes /ɬ ʃ ʂ ɳ r/ while Penzl uses /tt dd ss zz nn rr/ respectively. I use /c j/ for his /tʃ dʒ/. In his later book, A Reader of Pashto 1965, he uses the same symbols for all the consonants as I do, except that he uses /ç/ for my /c/. Other differences between my symbols and his are in the affricate /ʃ,ʒ/, which he analyzes as clusters: /ts,dz/ respectively.

In the case of the vowels, Penzl has a set of short vowels /i a e u/ and a set of long ones (ee oo aa). In my analysis, length is not distinctive, and the vowels are /i e a/ (front), /a/ (central), and /u o a/ (back). What Penzl considers as long vowels /ee/ and /oo/, are here analyzed as diphthongs: /ey/ and /ow/.

Sometimes in informal spoken language, /w/ and /y/ form initial clusters with a preceding voiceless stop, fricative or /l/; e.g., /pyáź/ 'onion;' /syá/ 'black;' /lwááb/ 'inspissated juice.' Such forms alternate with /piyáź/, /siyá/, and /lowááb/.
PART II: PROBLEMS IN PASHTO MORPHOLOGY FOR SPEAKERS OF DARI

Introduction

Pashto and Dari are, as cognate languages, similar in some ways. But they are also different in many ways, and this fact causes difficulties for speakers of Dari learning Pashto. Our purpose in this chapter, which is based partly on a contrastive analysis of the two languages and partly on the writer's observations both as a student and as a teacher of Pashto, is to examine some of the difficulties in the area of morphology.

Broadly considered, the problems faced by the Dari speaker may be said to fall within two general types. Some involve phenomena which are present in both languages. Thus, the same major parts of speech, or similar ones, exist in both; they both distinguish between singular and plural in substantives and verbs; both have a three-way person distinction in pronouns and verbs; and so on. On the other hand, Pashto has certain grammatical categories with no formal parallels in Dari; e.g., case and gender. The Dari speaker faces problems not only in the latter type of categories, but also in those of the first type, where--even though the general notions are familiar to him from his native Dari--he will have difficulties in mastering, besides the Pashto forms, the distribution and function of each form. As a
matter of fact, as will become clear from the following discussions and examples, there is hardly a Pashto utterance which does not present problems of both types. Thus, a noun usually appears in a case and gender form, so that the mere recognition of the word as a noun (a familiar concept) will not make it easy, because the total form requires the formal indication of the unfamiliar and obligatory categories of case and gender.

In what follows, we shall describe the problems in the following order:

(1) Those involving number, gender, and case in parts of speech other than the verb. These categories are all indicated by inflectional affixes.

(2) Those involving the verbal system. These include inflectional as well as other problems (auxiliaries, meanings of verb forms, etc.).

(3) Problems of agreement. These involve the entire Pashto system, cutting across (1) and (2).

(4) Problems of order, though these will be treated only very briefly and selectively—only as they affect phrasal constructions.

In Part II.1-3, description will focus on the noun. Adjectives and several other parts of speech do inflect for number,
gender, and case, but since they usually agree in these categories with the nouns with which they are related, the major problem is that of agreement and will, therefore, be taken up in the section on agreement. Any special features of number, gender, and case in substantives other than the noun will be noted at the end of relevant sections.

1. Number

In both languages, substantives are inflected for number, generally having distinctive forms for the singular and the plural. The problems in this area are of three types:

(1) There is a larger array of plural forms in Pashto than there is in Dari, especially in nouns and adjectives. This results in the necessity for remembering not only a larger number of plural devices, but also their correct distribution in relation to the stems to which they are added.

(2) In Pashto, each group of nouns or adjectives forms its plural according to a certain rule, and the rules are obligatory. In Dari, however, there does exist a single standard rule which can apply to all nouns and adjectives, side by side with a set of rules (mostly for broken plurals) which have limited and specified distributions, each applying to a different group of nouns and adjectives. For example:
D /ketáb/ 'book'; kotób/ /ketabá/

D /fékr/ 'thought'; /máfár/ /fekrá/

This arrangement in Dari makes the learning of Dari plural formation comparatively easy for the Pashto speaker, for, even when he cannot remember the various rules of plural formation, of which two are seen in the above examples (the first plural in each case), he can use the general plural suffix /-a/.

(3) One of the Pashto plural suffixes is /-an/, as in /mlikán/ 'boys'; /bæzamran/ 'farmers'; etc. As it happens, Dari has a plural morpheme phonologically identical with this, though D /-an/ is used only in writing. The identical phonological form of /-an/ in Dari and Pashto often misleads Dari learners to using it in Pashto in wrong places; e.g., they say /sarvaran/ instead of /sar/ 'men'; /mowran/ instead of /mændi/ 'mothers.'

2. Gender

Several facts should be noted concerning gender: (a) There is no grammatical gender in Dari. (b) In Pashto words denoting animate beings, gender generally follows natural sex; so these words cause no major difficulty except remembering the forms. (c) Feminine forms are usually identified by their final phonemes; so the problem is primarily a matter of remembering the feminine endings. In this respect, the
Pashto gender is easier than gender is in some languages in which one cannot tell the gender by phonological criteria. (d) Adjectives, like nouns, inflect for gender, but since they completely agree with related nouns in their gender, the major problem is one of agreement, which, therefore, will be taken up in the section on agreement. (e) The numerals in Pashto do not inflect for gender, except /γαmom/ 'one' and /δwαm/ 'two.'

3. Case

Pashto has a case system in the substantives while Dari has only the suffix /-m/, which to some extent functions as a case marker, but which lacks features of genuine full-fledged case suffixes. Besides, the Pashto case system is closely related to the prepositions. The distribution of the various cases will be discussed here:

   (1) The direct case is unmarked. It functions in two ways:

(a) With all intransitive verbs and with the present tense of transitive verbs, it functions as subject; e.g., /sawag ʃogam wini/ 'The man sees the woman'; /sawag wlar/ 'The man went.' (b) It functions as object (the goal of action) with transitive verbs in the past tense; e.g., /ma ʃogam wálidalem/ 'The woman was seen by me'.

(2) The oblique case functions in two ways: (a) With all transitive past forms, the noun in the oblique case expresses the agent; e.g., /zó spí xwáláley yam/ 'I have been bitten by the dog'.
(/spí/ obl. sing.). (b) In all other situations, it expresses the goal of action; e.g., /zá ṭowdóy xrm/ 'I eat my meal (/ṭowdóy/ obl. fem. sing.). The lack of oblique case in Dari may cause two types of problems: (a) The use of the correct case ending (oblique II) with certain prepositions and (b) the function of the oblique case in specific instances; that is to say, whether a given noun in the oblique case is the agent or the goal of action. The students tend to say: /ulímú tā wərkə/ instead of /ulíméy tə wərkə/ 'Give it to Halima'; /tər kówr pówri lármə/ instead of /tər kówrə pówri lármə/ 'I need to go as far as to the house.' In these examples, the students omit the case ending in /uliméy/ and /kówrə/ (obl. sing.). (b) is a problem of agreement and will be discussed later.

(3) The vocative case endings, whose use is restricted to words designating human beings, are often omitted by Dari learners. The endings are /-a/, /-ey/, /-i/. E.g., they tend to say /ēy əlīk/ instead of /ēy əlīkə/ 'Hey, boy!'; /məlgər/ instead of /məlgərey/ 'friend!'; /mówr/instead of /mówrə/ 'Mother!' The vocative in Dari is expressed by using the interjections /ów/ 'Oh!' and /ēy/ 'Hey!' as /ēy əcí/ 'Hey, boy!' and /ów raftəq/ 'Oh, friend!' It should be noted that in addition to the obligatory vocative endings, Pashto may also use the interjections /ey/ or /ow/, but that the latter are optional. Furthermore, these interjections are phonologically identical with the morphemes used to indicate the vocative in Dari, a fact which no doubt compounds the problem.
4. **Verbal System**

The verbal systems of Pashto and Dari are both characterized by mood-aspect-tense distinctions; the existence of two stems for most Dari verbs is parallel to the situation in Pashto; and both languages use prefixes and suffixes in their verbal systems. A great deal of difficulty, however, is caused by the differences between the languages in the forms, functions, and distribution of various verbal elements or combinations of elements. Some problems are caused by (a) irregular morphonemic relationships; (b) others by the over- or under differentiation of distinctions and/or forms in one or the other language; and (c) still others by the meaning of certain verb forms.

a. **Stem Forms**

There exists a large number of stem forms which the student has to memorize: /zém/ 'I go' vs. /lá̱rm/ 'I went'; /gówrm/ 'I see' vs. /kástæl̩m/ 'I looked at'; etc.

b. **Over- or Underdifferentiation**

The problems of this type involve the over- or underdifferentiation of forms and/or functions and/or meanings in Pashto as compared with Dari:

1. In Dari, the prefix /mey-/ always forms the imperfective aspect, as in /meyráwom/ 'I am going' or 'I will go' and /meyráftom/ 'I was going,' while in Pashto the prefix /wa-/ makes the imperfective
aspect in the present and the perfective aspect in the past. This results in confusion for the student. For example, P /zé spág tārám/ 'I tie the dog' vs. /zé spág wáta rám/ 'Shall I tie the dog?'; /má spág tārál/ 'I was tying the dog' vs. /má spág wáta rál/ 'I tied the dog.

(2) The prefix /bə-,/, which indicates futurity as in P /wábóğowru/ 'We will see' is often omitted by Dari students, presumably because in Dari there is no specific future maker as such, although the prefix /mey-/ in some contexts indicates futurity, as in /meybineym/ 'We'll see.'

(3) Pashto makes an aspect distinction between perfective and imperfective in the imperative as in /fārā/ 'Keep tying!' and /wātārəw/ 'Tie!,' while Dari does not make such a formal distinction, having a single form, as in /bóbánd/ 'Tie!'

(4) In the present tense, Pashto makes no distinction between singular and plural, as in P /cáy /fí/ 'He (she or they) drink(s) tea,' while in Dari there are two forms (sing. and pl.), as in /cáy méxyórəw/ 'He or she drinks tea'; /cáy méxyórən/ 'They drink tea.'

(5) Conversely, Pashto has two interchangeable second person plural past forms apparently with no difference in meaning, as in /xwaráləy/ and /xwaráləst/ 'You (pl.) had your meal.' In Dari there is only the one form /xórdeyn/ 'You ate.'

(6) In the third person singular and plural, the Pashto verb shows gender distinction between masculine and feminine in the past tense.
Dari does not. Consequently, sentences like the following are difficult to master: /təɾəl/ 'He was being tied'; /təɾəlɔ/ 'She was being tied'; /təɾəlɔ/ 'They (fem.) were being tied.' The first pair of these sentences are both rendered as /meybæst/ 'He (she) was tying' in Dari, and the last one as /bæstæ méyʃɔdæn/ 'They were being tied.' In other words, there is overdifferentiation in Pashto as compared with Dari.

c. Transitive Verb Forms

In the past stem transitive verb forms carry an automatically passive meaning; in the sentence /zɔ spí wɔxwarəlɔm/ 'I was bitten by the dog,' this feature is difficult for the Dari speaker to get used to because in Dari the unmarked verb is in the active voice, and the passive is formed by the past participle of the main verb and the relevant form of the auxiliary verb /ʃɔdæn/; e.g., /xɔrdæ ʃɔd/ 'It was eaten'; /kɔrɪm dɪdæ ʃɔd/ 'Karim was seen.'

d. Pronominal Forms

Pashto has a set of pronominal forms, /mi, di, yey, mu/ (1 sg., 2 sg., 3 sg. and pl., 1 and 2 pl., respectively, which function as subjects when used with a transitive verb in the past tense, as in /dæymi wɔlid/ 'I saw him,' and as objects or possessive markers elsewhere, as in /zɔ yey nɔxrem/ 'I don't eat it'; /ketæb mi rákæ/ 'Give me my book.' In Dari, there is a set of pronominal suffixes ("suffix
pronouns"), /-em, -et, -eż, -ema, -etan, eżan/ (1 sg., 2 sg., 3 sg., 1 pl., 2 pl., 3 pl.) which function as possessive markers when attached to substantives, as in /ketābem góm əxā/ 'My book was lost,' and as object marker when added to transitive verbs. The Dari forms are optional, being interchangeable with independent pronouns when used as possessives, and with a combination of a noun or a pronoun and the object-marker /-rma/, or a combination of a preposition and a noun or a pronoun when used as object markers. Not so with the Pashto pronominal forms. To add to the confusion, there is a slight phonological similarity in the first person singular in the two languages: /mi/ in Pashto and /-em/ in Dari. Because of this somewhat complex situation, the Dari speaker is likely either to omit the Pashto pronominals altogether, or to substitute the Dari forms. Thus, he may say /zá nāxrom/ instead of /zá yey nāxrom/ 'I don't eat it'; /ketābem cīrī dāy/ instead of /ketāb mi cīrī dāy/ 'Where is my book?'

5. Agreement

There are three major sets of problems of agreement: (a) those related to the government of prepositions over case; (b) those related to agreement between modifier and head; and (c) those related to agreement between the verb and its subject and in certain cases also its object.
(a) **Government of Prepositions over Case**

It is a special characteristic of Pashto morphology that the noun is usually governed by a preposition; i.e., all prepositions require the accompanying nouns to be in the oblique case, e.g., /tər yəkšambəy/ 'until Sunday.' The noun may at the same time be followed as well as preceded by a preposition as in /pə yəwə bəjə/ 'at one o'clock'; /tər pəmənə pəwri/ 'as far as Paghman!'; /tər špəy pəwri/ 'until night.' This distributional feature is absent in Dari, where prepositions can only precede the substantives, as in /tə xənə/ 'as far as to the house'; /bə dowstən/ 'to the friends'; etc., and where there are no postpositions of the type found in Pashto.

(b) **The Agreement between Modifier and Its Head**

Difficulties are also presented by the agreement between the modifier and its head (noun): (1) An adjective modifying a noun must agree in number, case, and gender; e.g., /čətə sərɨ/ 'big men'; /čətə sətə/ 'a big woman.' (2) A numeral agrees in case with its noun; e.g., /pə špəzəw bəjəw/ 'at six o'clock.' (3) A demonstrative pronoun and a noun agree in number, case, and gender, e.g., /də húgu sətu/ 'for those women.'

There is no agreement in Dari in any of these instances. Thus in /dəməxte kələn/ 'a big tree,' the noun and the adjective are both singular, and in /dəməxtəye kələn/ 'big trees,' the noun is plural,
but the adjective is in the singular. Dari students often fail to observe these rules of agreement, coming up with sentences such as the following, in which sometimes the inflectional endings are omitted from both the head and the modifier:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>instead of</th>
<th>'big books'</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>/šast ketabûnaw/</td>
<td>/šasti ketabûnaw/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii</td>
<td>/da šast ketabûnaw/</td>
<td>/da šastu ketabûnu/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii</td>
<td>/šast wânu/</td>
<td>/šastawânaw/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv</td>
<td>/da šast wânaw/</td>
<td>/da šasti wání/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
<td>/da šast wání/</td>
<td>/da šastu wânaw/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vi</td>
<td>/pa fâlôwru baju/</td>
<td>/pa fâlôwru baju/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vii</td>
<td>/pa ṣâp̪â ṣast ketabûnaw/</td>
<td>/pa ṣâp̪âçu šastu ketabûnu/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viii</td>
<td>/pa huqcâçu/</td>
<td>/pa huqcûçu/</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In examples i and v, the adjective (/šast/) must agree with the head in number (pl.), and in case (/da šastu/), direct and oblique, respectively. In examples ii and vi, the modifiers, an adjective (/šast/) and a numeral (/fâlôwr/), respectively, must agree with their heads (/ketabûnaw, baju/) in the oblique plural. In example iii, the modifying adjective and the noun must agree in the feminine gender. In example vii, the agreement is between the head word (/ketabûnaw/) and
the two modifiers (/спеш/) and the adjective (/שאלו/). In example viii, case agreement is required between the demonstrative pronoun /הנה/ and the noun /שאלו/ in the oblique plural form.

c. Agreement Involving the Verb

There are several types of problems of agreement involving the verb:

(1) There is person and number agreement between the verb and the subject in all intransitive verbs and in the present tense of the transitive verbs; e.g., /זא שאמ/ 'I go'; /זא יפי שאמ/ 'I beat him.'

(2) Wherever gender distinction is made in the verb (which is in the 3 sg. present of the verb 'to be,' and in the 3 sg. past of all the other verbs), it agrees with the subject in gender; e.g., /דא מְנָה נָה כָּנ/ 'This apple (fem.) is red'; /דא קָטָב סָר דָּמָי/ 'This book (m.) is red; /חלימה וָרָגָל/ 'Halima (fem.) went (fem.).'

(3) In the past forms of the transitive verbs, there is person, number, and gender agreement between the verb and its object, but not with its subject, e.g., /מָא דְוָדָּי וָסָמָא/ 'I eat (fem.) my meal (fem.)'; /קַרְיֵמ סַּפּי וָוָהאֲל/ 'Karim hit (fem.) the bitch (fem.)'; /וָא וָרְבָא בְּיוֹז/ 'I led (m.pl.) the donkeys (masc.pl.).'

(4) There is also agreement between the transitive past forms of verbs and the case of either the subject or the object, in the following way: If the grammatical subject is in the direct case, the object will have to be in the oblique case, and the verb will agree
with the grammatical subject (in person, number, and gender); e.g.,
/zó súri ḡawirmay/ 'I was bitten by the dog,' where /zó/ 'I' is in the
direct case and agrees with the verb in every respect, and where /súri/
is in the oblique case. If the grammatical subject is in the oblique
case, the grammatical object will have to be in the direct case, and
the verb agrees with the grammatical object; e.g., /dúy ḡowdúy
wáxwirmay/ 'They ate (fem.) their meal (fem.).'

4.6 Problems of Order

Problems of order strictly speaking belong in the syntax,
with which this thesis is not concerned. However, a few problems in-
volving order in phrases will be mentioned here.

(1) In some Pashto noun phrases, adjectives precede the nouns
they modify, as in P/jíg saráy/ 'a tall man.' An adverb also may pre-
cede a noun, as in /pówrta saráy/ 'the man above.' In Dari, modifying
nouns and adverbs follow the noun they modify in a connective /-e/
construction, as in /adáme belán/ 'a tall man'; and /nafáre balá/ 'the
man above.' Dari students of Pashto tend to transfer their own struc-
ture (without the connective /-e/) to Pashto, thus saying /saráy jíg/
instead of /jíg saráy/; /saráy pówrta/ instead of /pówrta saráy/.

(2) In Pashto noun phrases, the noun (1) may precede the
preposition, as in /alík tā/ 'to the boy'; (2) may follow the
preposition, as in /la kówrā/ 'from the house';, or (3) may be
followed as well as preceded by prepositions, as in /tər kówrə pówri/
'as far as the house,' while in Dari no preposition follows the noun,
as in /æz xatέre šagərdá/ 'for the sake of students.' The students
usually tend to drop the preposition after the nouns as in /də
šagərdánu/ instead of /də šagərdánu dəpærə/ 'for the sake of students';
/də náwey/ instead of /də náwey dəpærə/ 'for the bride'; etc.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


