Evaluation of Four Unesco-assisted Projects:

Academy for Teacher Educators
Higher Teachers' College
Regional Educational Development Programme
Educational Planning Team

January-February 1970

by S. Spaulding
T. P. Lightbody
P. Perrot
N. P. Raman
A. M. Lorenzo

unesco
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. General</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Summary of recommendations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Educational planning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Experimentation and development</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Educational personnel training</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Serial No. 1910
In June 1969 the Royal Afghan Government, in their letter 421/31-3-48 of 19 June 1969 from the First Deputy Minister of Education to the Unesco Chief-of-Mission, requested an evaluation of the four Unesco-assisted projects in Afghanistan, i.e. the Educational Planning Team, the Academy for Teacher Educators, the Higher Teachers' College and the Regional Educational Development Programme. In particular, the request referred to the need for evaluation of the following:

(a) Co-ordination and concentration of effort;
(b) progress made in the training of Afghans to take over positions of responsibility;
(c) the structure and rôle of the Academy for Teacher Educators;
(d) the integration of the Academy for Teacher Educators and the Higher Teachers' College into the Afghan system;
(e) the scale and structure of the fellowship programme.

In November 1969 the Director-General of Unesco paid an official visit to Afghanistan. An Aide-Memore was signed by the Minister of Education, the Minister of Information and Culture, and the Director-General. Inter alia, in the context of Unesco assistance to education, the Aide-Memore referred to the advisability of:

(a) The restructuring of Unesco's assistance, concentrating on overall educational planning, primary and secondary curriculum revision, and the training of primary and secondary teachers;
(b) the construction of a planning team, complete in itself, attached to the Department of Planning of the Ministry of Education;
(c) the setting up of a permanent unit for curriculum revision in the Ministry of Education, attached to the Department of Planning;
(d) the co-ordination and streamlining of the three existing projects in the field of pre-service and in-service teacher training, and the extension of these into the provinces;
(e) the early arrival of the evaluation mission requested by the government.

In January 1970 a mission consisting of Mr. S. Spaulding, Director, Department of School and Higher Education, Unesco; Mr. T.P. Lightbody, Head, Department of Overseas Education, Moray House College of Education, Edinburgh; Mr. P. Perrot, Unesco Expert on Educational Planning, Madagascar; Mr. N.P. Raman, Evaluation Division, UNDP; and Mr. A.M. Lorenzo, ILO Regional Manpower Adviser, undertook the following tasks in relation to the four Unesco-assisted projects in Afghanistan:

Serial No. 1910
(a) To study the operation of these projects and make recommendations regarding the best possible structure that would allow for greater coherence and concentration of Unesco's programme of aid to education in Afghanistan;

(b) to examine the possibilities of merging certain aspects (experimentation in educational methods and techniques and educational administration) of the Regional Educational Development Programme with the work of the educational planning team, and of concentrating teacher-training activities in two well-structured projects;

(c) to submit its consolidated report to the Director-General of Unesco.

After their briefing at Unesco Headquarters, Paris, from 26-28 January 1970, Mr. Lightbody and Mr. Perrot arrived in Kabul on 29 January and stayed until 24 February. Mr. Spaulding joined the mission in Kabul on 1 February and remained until 11 February. Mr. Raman and Mr. Lorenzo arrived on 13 February and participated in the work of the mission until 24 February. Mr. A. Shahbaz, Resident Representative of UNDP, and Mr. W. Semerdjian, Assistant Resident Representative of UNDP, also assisted the work of the mission and Mr. P. Joffre, Unicef Representative in Kabul, was at hand to give advice when required.

The mission met a wide range of officials of the Royal Government of Afghanistan and personnel of Unesco and other agencies, and visited all the Unesco projects and a selection of other institutions. Details of the individuals and institutions contacted are given in Appendix "A" to this Report.

Visits to institutions were limited by a number of factors: weather, the dual vacation system for hot and cold areas, and the incidence of the four-day Eid holiday during the period of the mission. This last proved to be in one way an advantage, in that it provided a period for review and consolidation between the fact-finding activities of the mission and final discussions.

A most useful corpus of briefing material was made available to the mission, both in Paris and in Kabul, and was of great value to the mission in planning its activities and in providing background. A bibliography of this material is attached as Appendix "B" to this Report.

The work of the mission was greatly facilitated by the co-operation and assistance it received from all the individuals and institutions with which it came into contact. It would be invidious to single out examples - co-operation was of a uniform standard of excellence, and the efficiency with which the mission's programme was arranged deserves high praise.

II. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

A. GENERAL

1. A more balanced pattern of educational development should be established, as between the levels of education and as between the output of the system and the country's manpower requirements.
2. A policy should be formulated to enable the University to make its due contribution to Afghan education in the fields of educational planning, experimentation and development, and personnel training.

B. EDUCATIONAL PLANNING

1. The Planning Department of the Ministry of Education should be enlarged and strengthened to secure the balanced educational development indicated in A.1 above.

2. There should be a review and a readjustment of the functions of the various sections of the Planning Department for greater co-ordination and impact.

3. A General Planning Unit, relieved of routine operational tasks and with a clearly defined function, should be created within the Planning Department, in order to define and elaborate long-term and short-term educational goals.

4. The development of the General Planning Unit may require the assistance of a planning team of international experts, complete in itself, with appropriate areas of expertise, if the government agrees to the above recommendation, i.e. to establish the General Planning Unit.

5. The present Unesco Planning Team should be reorganized from its present structure of a number of operational individuals to a planning team of the type indicated in B.4 above, to help establish a sound planning mechanism which will structurally facilitate integration and co-ordination of all aspects of education, including experimentation and development.

6. Subject to the decision of the government on B.1 and 2 above, this reorganization may be effected during the remainder of the period of the present project, thus forming the basis of a new and more effective project if required.

C. EXPERIMENTATION AND DEVELOPMENT

1. An Experimentation and Development Department should be established in the Ministry of Education for the co-ordination of various efforts in qualitative development of education and for the better integration of the qualitative aspect of educational development into the overall educational planning.

2. The Experimentation and Development Department should have as its primary task the organization, supervision and co-ordination of all activities in the educational system in these fields.

3. Units, institutions and self-contained projects solely concerned with experimentation and development activities should be incorporated in, or at least grouped with, the new department.

4. There should be established within this department its own operational team for the conduct of experimentation and development activities in the provinces, in case the existing institutions do not cover any particular field required.

Serial No. 1910
5. The Regional Educational Development Programme should be reorganized during 1970-1971 as follows:

(a) Its personnel training function should be transferred to the Academy for Teacher Educators;

(b) Its experimentation and development personnel should be attached for this period to appropriate institutions under the Ministry, for subsequent recruitment to the project envisaged in C.6 below.

6. Consideration should be given to an extended UNDP project, to start in 1971, to assist in the establishment of a high-level Experimentation and Development Department at the Ministry of Education.

7. Consideration should be given to creating a close link between this project and the Educational Planning Project (B.4 above) in order to establish from the outset the degree of collaboration and co-ordination necessary between the two projects.

8. A National Advisory Council for Experimentation and Development should be created, on which the Ministry of Education, the University and other appropriate bodies would be represented.

D. EDUCATIONAL PERSONNEL TRAINING

1. The concept that the training of all key personnel connected with the teaching function is a single, co-ordinated training commitment, should be accepted and training structures designed accordingly.

2. There should be an official policy of access to schools and training institutions for teachers and teacher educators on "teaching practice".

3. There should be a standard pattern of teacher-training institution, consisting of a combined unit for training primary and middle school teachers.

4. There should be a long-term plan, included in the next Five-Year Development Plan, for the progressive development and decentralization of pre-service teacher training.

5. In-service teacher training should be developed on a national and co-ordinated basis, and full use made of the modern range of techniques.

6. A National Advisory Council for Educational Personnel Training should be established, on which the Ministry of Education, the University and other interested bodies would be represented.

7. The present Unesco-assisted projects in personnel training should be reorganized in 1970/1971 as follows:

(a) The Academy for Teacher Educators should be expanded to assume overall responsibility for key personnel training and to integrate the personnel training activities of the existing Unesco-assisted projects;
(b) the regional advisory function of the Academy should therefore be extended to include the DMAs and Higher Teachers' Colleges;

(c) if broadcasting is to be used primarily for training, the educational expert should be attached to the Academy.

8. For the period after 1971, consideration should be given to the establishment of a unified long-term personnel training project (an Educational Personnel Development Programme having as its nucleus the present Academy), which would concentrate all efforts on key personnel training, and would continue the present advisory service to DMAs and extend it to higher teachers' colleges. The present higher teachers' college project could be extended as a relatively short-term component of this new project.

9. Attention should be given to the administrative problems arising within projects as a result of the different conditions under which personnel and equipment are supplied by different agencies. Attention should also be given to various administrative regulations and practices which have served as obstacles to project effectiveness in the past, with a view to eliminating them or reducing their negative impact.

10. The scope and operation of the fellowship programme should be reviewed, and a senior official of Unesco should visit Afghanistan for this purpose.

11. The valuable WFP aid to training institutions in Afghanistan should be continued and if possible extended.

III. EDUCATIONAL PLANNING

A. THE PRESENT SITUATION

1. Balanced development

The recent rapid growth of the educational system has created imbalances within the system, both as between the various educational levels of the system, and as between the products of the system and the country's manpower requirements. Furthermore, some of the quantitative expansion has been achieved at the expense of qualitative development.

2. Forward planning

In the above situation, and on the eve of the preparation of the fourth five-year plan and the detailed sectoral plan for educational development, quantitative expansion and qualitative development require simultaneous and coordinated attention. The Planning Department of the Ministry of Education is at present mainly concerned with quantitative expansion and not with overall qualitative development of education.

3. Manpower problems

If the Planning Department is to translate into educational terms the general policy for the economic and social development of the country, it must have at its disposal an analysis of manpower requirements and supply at the different levels of qualification. At present, this is not the case.
(a) Manpower data is lacking in precision, and there are wide divergencies between estimates made by different services (vide "Manpower and Education in Afghanistan", Ministry of Education, 1969).

(b) There is a shortage of middle- and high-level manpower in certain important areas. Yet at the same time the distribution of graduates does not always meet the needs of the country, and there are already signs of over-production in some sectors.

4. **Liaison with university**

The inadequacy of links between the University and the Ministry of Education affects all three of the areas with which this report is concerned: educational planning; experimentation and development; and personnel training.

5. **Present structure of the Planning Department**

This has been fully described in previous reports, in particular those of Mr. Renoux (December 1968) and Mr. Bertrand (November 1969) so only its main lines are indicated here.

(a) **General Directorate of Planning and Co-ordination**: Elaboration of the educational plan, budgetary estimates for development of education, annual budgetary plan, co-ordination with the Ministry of Planning, studies and assessment of educational plan implementation. Three offices, within this General Directorate, are especially responsible for liaison with the Department of Primary, Secondary and Vocational Education.

(b) **General Directorate of Statistics**: Preparing and dispatching questionnaires, organization and carrying out of surveys, participation in the elaboration of the educational plan. These tasks are distributed between two offices, respectively responsible for collecting and interpreting data.

(c) **Directorate of Foreign Aid**: Relations with external assistance agencies, co-ordination of external aid and its integration into the educational plan.

(d) **Unesco Planning Team**: It is currently made up of four experts in charge of vocational and technical education planning, women's educational planning, educational broadcasting and adult education planning.

6. **Problems of the present structure**

(a) General. These are fully analysed in the reports of Mr. Renoux and Mr. Bertrand, and arise from a number of factors: lack of precision in the definition of the tasks and responsibilities of the above planning offices; some degree of confusion between planning and operational activities; the absence of a unit for the effective co-ordination of activities in research, experimentation and development; and the dispersion of budgetary operations through several directorates, and even through several departments.
b) The Unesco Planning Team. It is clear that three of the expert posts (Educational Broadcasting, Women's Education and Adult Education) have little connexion with the normal functions of a Planning Unit. The operational aspects of these activities tie them more naturally to centres or services outside of the Planning Department. On the other hand, the team lacks the type of expert posts which are essential to the creation of a planning unit in the normal sense.

B. THE NEEDS

The needs, in the present situation, may be stated as follows:

1. The need for an enlargement and a strengthening in terms of numbers, qualifications and managerial competence of the Planning Department in order to rectify, and avoid in future, imbalance in educational development, and to ensure that the country's manpower needs are met.

2. The need for a restatement of the overall functions of the Planning Department and also the functions of its various sections for more effective co-ordination and impact.

3. The need to establish a structural framework within the Ministry of Education to ensure closer and functional relations between the Planning Department and other departments and services, especially those in charge of experimentation and development, in order to integrate new developments and the results of experimentation into planning.

4. The need for a permanent and functional link between the General Planning Unit and the University.

5. The need to re-structure the Unesco Planning Team as a planning unit complete in itself, as a more effective form of aid.

C. PROPOSALS

1. General Planning Unit

This unit should be relieved of all routine operational tasks and fully occupied with the definition and elaboration of both short- and long-term educational goals. Under the control of a President or a Vice-President, it would guide the overall preparation of the plan. For this purpose it would be concerned with the following principal topics:

(a) Definition of educational targets and objectives.

(b) Integration of educational, social and economic development plans.

(c) General balance of the scholastic system.

(d) Adjustment of the output of the educational system to manpower requirements and employment possibilities.

Serial No. 1910
(e) Wastage and efficiency.
(f) Unit costs and cost effectiveness.
(g) Quantitative planning for teacher training at all levels, in collaboration with the University and the training structure of the Ministry.

It is suggested that the General Planning Unit be composed of high-level Afghan officials and that it be very closely assisted by the three General Directorates of the Department of Planning. The existence, in the three General Directorates, of officials with a solid academic background, often complemented by training abroad, and perhaps additional qualified staff recruited from the Institute of Education, will facilitate the appointment of appropriate personnel to the General Planning Unit.

2. International experts

The General Planning Unit may be assisted by a team of international experts. The basic objective of this assistance is to help establish an institutional framework based on the General Planning Unit, to ensure a continuous process of educational planning and assessment. The team of international experts would be co-ordinated by an educational planner. The other members of the team would be specialists in such fields as those listed below, according to the progressive requirements of the unit's activities:

(a) Educational financing, financial aspects of planning, cost effective studies.

(b) Planning vocational and technical education.

(c) Manpower planning (this could be an ILO expert, attached to the Ministry of Education - see Appendix "C").

(d) Statistics. (In spite of the excellent work done by the present General Directorate of Statistics, the assignment of an expert in statistics could, however, be useful in this team in order to advise on new and supplementary data required for various detailed planning activities and appropriate methods for its collection and analysis).

This team of experts would constitute the permanent nucleus of the team for the length of the project. In addition, it would be useful to call upon specialist consultants for short-term missions to cover certain other fields for specific jobs: sociology of education, women's education, out-of-school education, agricultural education, rural education, adult education, etc.

Details of the proposed distribution of posts and personnel of the present Educational Planning Team, and of additional posts required, are shown in Appendix "C".

It is essential that each expert considers the further training of his counterpart(s) as a prime objective. Moreover, planning work being above all a group activity, the primary task of the Planning Team should be to develop the group of Afghan officials as a team. Thus, the usual expert/counterpart relationship would be replaced by the expanded concept of expert team/counterpart team.
3. The General Directorate of Planning and Co-ordination

In liaison with all bodies concerned (other directorates, other departments in the Ministry of Education, provincial services, various commissions, and the Ministry of Planning) this General Directorate would continue to be responsible for elaborating, drafting, disseminating and continuously assessing the educational plan under the guidance of the General Planning Unit. It seems to be desirable that this Directorate be relieved of other tasks concerning the preparation and control of the budget, as indicated in paragraph 5 below.

4. General Directorate of Statistics

With the creation of a General Planning Unit, this Directorate could fully devote itself to the work of elaborating questionnaires, material organization of surveys, (including surveys requested by the Experimentation and Development Sector), publication and diffusion of basic data and, finally, maintenance of an up-to-date school map.

5. General Directorate of Educational Financing (Currently the Directorate of Foreign Aid)

This General Directorate would constitute a larger entity than the present Directorate of Foreign Aid. It seems artificial to limit the activities of such a service to projects financed by external assistance. The scope of this Directorate should be extended to all educational investments, including those financed from national resources.

Thus, this Directorate would be entirely responsible for the preparation of the Five-Year budget, and of the annual investment budgets. To carry out these increased duties, it would probably be better to relieve it of all tasks concerning budgetary management and expenditure control, work which could be more rationally centralized outside of the Planning Department.

IV. EXPERIMENTATION AND DEVELOPMENT

A. THE PRESENT SITUATION

1. Research and experimentation

Various potentially useful activities are going on in different institutions under different projects. These, however, are not co-ordinated, nor do they appear to be geared to the priorities of the country, or associated with the forward planning activities of the Ministry of Education.

2. Curriculum development

Several institutions are operating in this field, and the USAID project in curriculum development is currently attached to the Department of Primary Education at the Ministry. There appears to be no permanent, central machinery for curriculum development, which is of course a continuous process which cannot be limited to the life of any one project.
3. **Audio-visual aids and textbooks**

This work is again shared among several units, including the Audio-visual Aids Centre, the Compilation Department of the Ministry and the government facilities for printing and reproduction. In addition, work on a limited scale is being conducted in a variety of institutions.

4. **The University Institute of Education**

An outstanding feature of the present situation is the under-use of the resources of the Institute of Education in the field of research and experimentation and its lack of relationship to the current problems and plans of the Ministry of Education. The Institute appears to be extremely generously staffed, in proportion to its present programme. The Ministry of Education, at the same time, is in need of a structure that will meet its experimentation and development needs in relation to its programme of educational expansion.

5. **Unesco-assisted project - Regional Educational Development Programme**

This project, intended for general educational development in the provinces, is not in fact fully effective in this field, and shows the following features:

(a) The Central Unit for Regional Educational Development (CURED) is not sufficiently integrated with the structure or functions of the Ministry to achieve either effective co-ordination with other operators in the same field or the final utilization of the work done in CURED;

(b) at the provincial level, there is considerable involvement in operational teacher training and an inevitable tendency for the regional advisers to be so fully occupied with teacher training as to have little time available for educational development in the wider sense;

(c) the Regional Educational Development Programme was originally conceived as a vehicle to disseminate and experiment with the resources developed not only by CURED but also by the Higher Teachers' College and the Academy for Teacher Educators, at the provincial level. However, there was a lack of co-ordination and integration of resources developed at these institutions in Kabul and it has failed to act as a vehicle for experimentation and development;

(d) this situation of the Regional Educational Development Programme has had unfortunate results: its almost full-time involvement in teacher training represents a fragmentation of effort in this field; the isolation of CURED prevents effective use being made of the results of research and experimentation; and a tendency has developed within the project to regard the project as an end in itself instead of a temporary aid presence to assist Afghan education.

B. **THE NEEDS**

The needs, in the present situation, may be stated as follows:

1. The need for the co-ordination of the potentially useful work being done by different individuals and institutions in all areas of experimentation and development.
2. The need for a permanent structure to provide this co-ordination and also to link the work done in experimentation and development with the forward planning activities of the Ministry of Education.

3. The need for a definition of the rôle of the University Institute of Education in the Ministry's Experimentation and Development Programme and of its relationship to the structure of the Ministry in these fields.

4. The need for a restructuring of the Unesco-assisted Regional Educational Development Programme project to eliminate duplication of effort and to integrate it more effectively with the work of the Ministry in experimentation and development.

C. PROPOSALS

1. Ministry structure

It is strongly recommended that an Experimentation and Development Department be established in the Ministry of Education in order to ensure overall qualitative development of education. This Department should operate under a president and under the same deputy minister as the Planning Department. It would have the following functions:

(a) The co-ordination of activities throughout the education system in experimentation and development (including applied research, curriculum development, teaching aids, textbooks).

(b) The planning and organization of such activities both at central and at provincial level, in accordance with the requirements and priorities of the Ministry of Education.

(c) Collaboration with the Planning Department to ensure that progress in experimentation and development is fully utilized in the Ministry's forward planning activities.

The professional staff required by the Department for such functions would be of two types: managerial, for the planning, supervision and co-ordination of activities in experimentation and development; and operation, for the field conduct of these activities and the feedback of the results. The latter may be undertaken through existing institutions which would be integrated or associated with the new government structure for experimentation and development.

2. Curriculum development

It would be desirable for self-contained projects in this field (such as the USAID project in curriculum development) to be attached to or closely associated with the government structure for experimentation and development proposed in paragraph 1 above.

3. Audio-visual aids and textbooks

It would also be desirable that units concerned with the preparation of teaching aids and textbooks be incorporated in (or at least grouped with) the new government structure for experimentation and development.
4. **University Institute of Education**

A long-term policy should be formulated regarding the future role of the Institute in the programme of the Ministry of Education in experimentation and development, and the Ministry's own structure planned in the light of this.

5. **Unesco-assisted project - Regional Educational Development Programme: Reorganization**

Any future project in experimentation and development should be more broadly-based, more co-ordinated with similar operations, and incorporated in a permanent Ministry structure for experimentation and development; this structure should itself be closely linked to the Ministry's Department of Planning. Meanwhile, however, there is an urgent need for the rationalization of the existing project.

(a) **Short-term reorganization (1970-1971).** The purpose of this would be to eliminate duplication of function within the Unesco-assisted projects and at the same time facilitate the planning of any future project. No additional funds would be required.

(i) The teacher-training functions of the Regional Educational Development Programme should be transferred to the Academy for Teacher Educators, as indicated in Section V, thus rationalizing the training function of the projects.

(ii) Kandahar and Mazar-i-Sharif should cease to be specially designated "pilot centres", on the principle that experimentation and development activities should be free to assist any region according to its need.

(iii) CURED should for this period cease to be a self-contained unit, and its personnel redistributed to Ministry Departments and units where their experience in CURED may be made available in the operational sphere, and they themselves can become acquainted with the operations of the Ministry in their fields.

(iv) As proposed in Appendix "D", international experts in charge of personnel training would be transferred operationally to the Academy for Teacher Educators to enable it to discharge the extended function indicated in Section V; the holders of experimentation and development type posts would be assigned as indicated in sub-para. (iii) above, but would, for the time being, administratively come under the Educational Planning Team, if the post of the Chief Technical Adviser for the Regional Educational Development Programme remains vacant; in the event, however, of a new research and development project being envisaged, savings from the Chief Technical Adviser's post may be used for the advance recruitment of a Project Manager for the new project. In this case, the Research and Development personnel of the Regional Educational Development Programme would, of course, come under the new Project Manager.

(v) In effect, the Regional Educational Development Programme as at present conceived would disappear and the foundations be laid for a more logical project structure after 1971, when the experimentation and development personnel of CURED might as far as possible be reappointed to the new project.
(b) Long-term proposals (after 1971)

(1) It is recommended that consideration be given to an extended UNDP-assisted project to help with the establishment of a high-level experimentation and development structure, which would be closely associated with the Ministry's Department of Planning. Depending on the government structure, this might be a single project covering educational planning, experimentation and development, or two projects, one in educational planning and the other in experimentation and development. From the discussions held it would appear likely that the experimentation and development structure would be a department parallel to the present Planning Department, so that two projects appear more probable.

(ii) The experimentation and development project, or element of a project, would have two major objectives: the establishment of a central co-ordinating structure at the Ministry of Education, incorporating the Ministry's main activities in these fields, and closely associated with the Ministry's forward planning activities; and the establishment, within this structure, of an effective experimentation and development service for the provinces, to assist the implementation of the policy of educational decentralization.

(iii) It would be highly desirable that this experimentation and development structure should operate with an Advisory Council for Experimentation and Development at national level, on which the Ministry of Education, the University and other interested institutions would be represented. Such a national council might be combined with the National Council for the Training of Educational Personnel proposed in Section V.

(iv) The personnel required by the Experimentation and Development Department would vary from time to time according to the Ministry's priorities and the nature of the Department's tasks at any one time. This would indicate the need for a flexible system of secondments by the government and of short-term consultants by the project. There would, however, be a permanent nucleus, both at managerial and operational levels, which would cover at least the following:

(a) Applied research.
(b) Curriculum development (general).
(c) Testing and examining.
(d) Teaching aids.
(e) Textbooks.

V. EDUCATIONAL PERSONNEL TRAINING

A. THE PRESENT SITUATION

1. In accordance with modern educational thinking, this section includes not only the preparation of teachers, but of those other key personnel (head-teachers, teacher educators, supervisors, and administrators) whose work is directly concerned with the teaching and learning process.
2. General. At present, primary school teachers are trained at institutions known as DMAs(1) assisted by the Academy for Teacher Educators. The Academy has been assisted by Unesco and Unicef since 1963 and by UNDP since 1964. Middle school teachers are trained by the Higher Teachers' College in Kabul which received UNDP assistance. Under the Regional Educational Development Programme, which is also assisted by UNDP, primary and middle school teachers are being trained in two pilot centres recently opened in Kandahar and Mazar-i-Sharif. The Regional Educational Development Programme is also training other educational personnel listed in paragraph 1 above. Lycée teachers are trained by the University. Further information on teacher training in Afghanistan is fully documented in the bibliography given in Appendix "B" and there is no need to discuss it in detail here. The following items are selected as being of immediate relevance to personnel training.

3. Qualitative situation of the teaching staff: This is summarized in the following table (Source: "Education in Afghanistan - Ministry of Education, 1968")

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Primary schools</th>
<th>Secondary schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Below grade 9</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DMA emergency or grade 9</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades 9-11, general education</td>
<td>38.2</td>
<td>21.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular DMA, grades 11-12</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lycée grade 12</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic and vocational schools</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Teachers' College</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Licence or higher</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Three points should be mentioned:

(a) Measures for qualitative improvement (e.g., the establishment of the Higher Teachers' Colleges, of the Academy for Teacher Educators, and of the one-year professional course for grade 12 graduates at DMA) are fairly recent and need time to show results.

(b) On the other hand, the extremely rapid expansion of middle and Lycée education renders it impossible for the teacher-training structure, however well designed, to keep abreast of the rising demand for teachers.

(c) Qualitative improvement in teacher supply is a matter of urgency.

4. Quantitative situation. This is directly related to the qualitative situation because of limitations in manpower resources and in training facilities. The main features are the following:

(a) The present teacher-training machinery is inadequate to meet the needs of expansion at the minimum rate required by the country, despite the sound policy of decentralization of teacher-training facilities. For example, at middle school level:

(1) Primary teacher training colleges.

Serial No. 1910
Teachers required for third five-year plan (1967-1971) - 2,198
Expected output from Higher Teachers' College - 742
Anticipated deficit - 1,456

(b) The above situation is exacerbated by the imbalance in the rate of expansion of education, as indicated by the following table (Source: "Manpower and Education in Afghanistan" - Ministry of Education, 1969).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Plan Target</th>
<th>Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1967-1968</td>
<td>Rate of expansion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary education</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle schools</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lycées</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are three clear implications:

(i) No teacher-training machine can hope to service expansion at this unplanned rate.

(ii) Quantitative development in such circumstances is achieved at the expense of quality.

(iii) Development of this nature makes the planning of the teacher-training structure extremely difficult.

5. Kabul University. One of the clearest features of the present situation is the under-use of the resources of the University as a whole in meeting the personnel training needs of the Ministry of Education. The work performed by the University is mainly confined to the training of lycée teachers, and the extent and organization of this does not always correspond to the requirements of the national education system; there appears to be an absence of contact and co-ordination of effort in the service of education; and there is some degree of duplication of effort both inside and outside the University.

6. Lack of co-ordination and concentration of effort. This has already been mentioned in Section IV, and is treated also in paragraph 7 of this Section. But it applies with special force in the field of in-service training, where the main features of the situation are:

(a) The absence of an overall long-range co-ordinated operational plan for in-service training, the need for which is strongly indicated by the teacher qualification statistics in paragraph 3 above.

(b) The use of relatively expensive and administratively difficult "confrontation" methods of in-service training, without the development of other techniques such as correspondence courses, radio programmes, "guided study", and the various combinations of these with confrontation methods, which have proved so successful elsewhere.

7. The Unesco-assisted projects in teacher training. (Academy for Teacher Educators, Higher Teachers' College, Regional Educational Development Programme). The main points are these:
(a) As indicated by project reports, and as is apparent on the ground, much good work has been done, and real and permanent progress achieved.

(b) The Academy for Teacher Educators has made progress towards becoming a viable self-supporting institution and, if expanded, should be able to function as a vehicle for undertaking the training of all kinds of educational personnel with the exception, perhaps, of lycée teachers.

(c) The Higher Teachers' College in Kabul is developing into a useful permanent unit within the Afghan education system despite initial problems such as poor enrolment and slow rate of counterpart training. The development of the Higher Teachers' College as a self-supporting institution is likely to take some time.

(d) The third project, Regional Education Development Programme, in its present form, is not integrating satisfactorily, as indicated in Section IV.

(e) The target in numerical terms of the fellowship programme incorporated in the projects has, in the main, been achieved but serious consideration needs to be given to the different types of training available under this programme. Training given to the Afghan counterparts at institutions in the developed countries has not been geared to the needs of the projects. This might be considered as one of the reasons for the uneven distribution of counterpart staff and the slow rate at which they are able to take over responsibilities from international experts. It would now be appropriate to undertake a review of the fellowship programme policy and its operational conduct.

(f) As a result of the history, timing and development of these projects, there is at present some measure of overlapping, duplication of effort and lack of co-ordination, e.g.

(i) The Academy for Teacher Educators, rightly, is associated with 5 DMAs in the provinces; but the remaining two, though identical in function, come under the Regional Education Development Programme.

(ii) The Higher Teachers' College (Kabul), with most experience of middle school teacher training, has no official connexion with the provincial Higher Teachers' Colleges which are part of the Regional Educational Development Programme.

(iii) In-service training activities are carried on by all three; for primary school teachers by the Academy for Teacher Educators and the Regional Educational Development Programme; for middle school teachers by the Higher Teachers' College and the Regional Educational Development Programme.

(iv) The key personnel in teacher training are also trained under different arrangements - teacher educators by the Academy for Teacher Educators, and supervisors and administrators by the Regional Educational Development Programme.
The Regional Educational Development Programme presence in the provinces is virtually full-time teacher training, while the Central Unit for Regional Educational Development in Kabul, is insufficiently integrated with the other developmental activities of the Ministry of Education to be effective.

8. World Food Program (WFP) assistance. Mention should be made of the food assistance given to boarding schools (including all personnel training institutions in and outside Kabul) under the current World Food Programme projects numbers 109 and 496 and 436. This assistance has been of great value in reducing the recurrent costs of these institutions, thus releasing funds for educational purposes.

B. THE NEEDS

The needs in the present situation may be broadly summarized as follows:

1. Key personnel training. The need to recognize that the training of key personnel (teacher educators, headteachers, supervisors, educational administrators) whose work is in close association with, and indeed influences and in part controls, the teaching function, is an essential concomitant of teacher training; and that this key personnel training requires an integrated and coordinated policy.

2. Balance in educational expansion. The need for a restoration of a balanced expansion of the educational system at its various levels, and the creation of a teacher training system to service such balanced expansion, thus facilitating quantitative expansion together with qualitative development.

3. University contribution. The need for a long-term decision as to whether and if so to what extent, the university is to be integrated with the long-range programme of the Ministry of Education for post-graduate personnel training; and whether this is, in the circumstances, to be a two-phase operation, with the Ministry creating its own structure in a first phase, and possibly transferring this structure to the university in a second phase.

4. Pre-service teacher training. The need for a long-term plan for the expansion and decentralization of teacher training, at primary and middle school level, to produce adequately qualified teachers in sufficient numbers; and the co-ordination of the training of lycée teachers, currently done by the university with the Ministry's plans for the development of lycée education.

5. In-service teacher training. The need for a long-term plan for in-service teacher training, embracing both up-grading courses for sub-standard teachers and refresher courses for fully trained teachers, on a co-ordinated basis and utilizing the full modern range of techniques in this field.

6. Unesco-assisted projects. The need to streamline and reorganize the Unesco-assisted projects in the field of personnel development in the light of the above needs and to secure greater concentration of effort and increased effectiveness both within themselves and in relation to the other activities of the Ministry of Education. This should include a review of the policy, objectives and operation of the fellowship programme.
C. PROPOSALS

1. General. The rationalization and streamlining of the Unesco-assisted projects cannot be divorced from government policy in the fields in which the projects operate, as the national structure is the permanent structure and the Unesco structure a temporary aid presence. The following five paragraphs in this section make suggestions on such issues.

2. Key personnel training. It is strongly recommended that the global concept of key personnel training, as a single structure of interrelated functions be accepted (ref. paragraph B.1 above), and the training of all such personnel be considered as a co-ordinated training commitment.

   It is proposed that this extended function be built on the basis of the Academy for Teacher Educators, the institution already established for the training of the first group of key personnel, primary teacher educators.

   In this connexion, so far as the training of teacher educators is concerned it is essential that there should be a policy of access to DMAs and Higher Teachers' Colleges for "teaching practice" for teacher educators in training. This is not simply a matter of regulation, but is a collaborative activity between the personnel training institute and the DMAs and Higher Teachers' Colleges. This would enable the model DMA, attached to the Academy for Teacher Educators to be dispensed with.

3. Balance of educational development. It is recommended that a balanced pattern for educational development at primary and secondary level be established in the next five year development plan.

   The permanent national structure of personnel training should then be developed in relation to this planned expansion.

4. The University. It is strongly recommended that a long-term policy be formulated in regard to the University's rôle in the development of Afghan education and particularly its contribution to the training programme of the Ministry of Education.

   In the meantime the work of the University in the field of training lycée teachers could well be co-ordinated more closely with the requirements of the Ministry of Education.

   A useful first step in the co-ordination of the work of the University and the Ministry in teacher training would be the establishment, at national level, of a co-ordinating body such as a National Council for Educational Personnel Training.

   It is suggested that further developments in the Ministry's own training system should be designed in the light of the above considerations, to facilitate the ultimate realization of the national policy.

5. Pre-service teacher training. It is suggested that the next five year development plan include a plan for the progressive development and decentralization of teacher-training activities.

Serial No. 1910
A standard pattern of teacher-training institution should be created, consisting of a combined unit for training primary and middle school teachers. With the introduction of the post-grade 12 professional course, these units will be operating at similar levels, and such an organization would have the advantages of economy and of maximum flexibility in the use of staff, accommodation and equipment. This could be introduced forthwith in the provinces, and should be considered as a possible long-term policy in Kabul also.

It is strongly recommended that an official policy of easy access to local schools for teaching practice be firmly established and implemented at primary and middle school levels, as an indispensable requirement to facilitate and strengthen both preservice and in-service teacher education. Laboratory schools do not adequately meet this need, and in addition tend to become increasingly unlike the ordinary schools in which the student will ultimately teach.

6. In-service teacher training. This should be considerably developed on a national and co-ordinated basis (although under decentralized arrangements as appropriate) as the quickest way of increasing the effectiveness of the present teaching force.

It is strongly recommended that the full modern range of techniques, especially those or radio, correspondence courses and guided study, be utilized, to increase the effectiveness of the programme and to reduce unit costs.

7. Unesco-assisted projects - functions. In respect of both the short-term (1970-1971) and the long-term (any new projects in similar areas after 1971) there is a need to rationalize the functions of these projects. Such rationalization should broadly do two things:

(a) Concentrate in a logical fashion the present dispersed activities in personnel training;

(b) associate experimentation and development activities with the structure of the Ministry of Education, and particularly with its educational planning activities.

Such rationalization is urgently necessary within the present projects, and would not prejudice in any way the situation after 1971. It should be carried out as follows:

Regional Educational Development Programme

As already indicated in Section IV, paragraph 5, and Appendix "D".

Academy for Teacher Educators

(i) The function of the Academy for Teacher Educators should be extended to cover the training of all key personnel connected with the teaching process, preservice and in-service. Those personnel would include primary teacher educators (currently trained by the Academy for Teacher Educators); middle school teacher educators (for training whom there is no permanent provision at present); headteachers, supervisors and administrators (currently trained by the Regional Educational Development Programme). The concentration is logical, economical and inevitable.

Serial No. 1910
(ii) The regional advisory structure of the Academy for Teacher Educators should be extended to cover the DMAs and Higher Teachers' Colleges at Kandahar and Mazar-i-Sharif, and other teacher-training institutions that may be established in the provinces.

(iii) The Academy for Teacher Educators should facilitate professional co-operation between the established DMA and Higher Teachers' College in Kabul and newer institutions in the provinces.

(iv) If government policy is to use the educational broadcasting unit primarily for training purposes, this unit should be incorporated in the revised Academy for Teacher Educators.

Higher Teachers' College

(i) The Higher Teachers' College will assume responsibility for the training of middle school teachers under the new integrated scheme of personnel training co-ordinated by the Academy for Teacher Educators. It would continue, with an increasing handover of its various aspects to Afghan counterparts. If the UNDP assistance were to be extended after 1971, it would be a relatively short-term assistance.

(ii) In the light of sub-paragraph (iii) above, the Higher Teachers' College, Kabul, would maintain a close professional collaboration (not officially provided at present) with Higher Teachers' Colleges in the provinces, under the supervision of the restructured Academy for Teacher Educators.

8. Unesco-assisted projects - structure

(a) Short-term (1970-1971)

It is believed that the above rationalization of function could be carried out administratively, as indicated in Appendices "D", "E" and "F" to this report without prejudice to the structure of any new projects after 1971, and indeed with beneficial results to any such projects.

(b) Long-term (after 1971)

If further assistance were requested for the period after 1971, in the field of training, there would be a logical concentration of effort in one major, long-term personnel training project (an Educational Personnel Development Programme, having as its nucleus the Academy for Teacher Educators), with possibly a relatively short-term commitment to the present Higher Teachers' College.

The new personnel training institute should continue the role of the present Academy for Teacher Educators in helping to establish, equip, staff and advise new provincial DMAs and Higher Teachers' Colleges. The beneficial effects of this system, with the same institution equipping, training staff and providing a follow-up advisory service for the provincial training colleges, are very clear.

High quality staff is essential for a personnel development institution of this kind, with a combination of good academic qualifications and senior experience in their fields. This means that adequate conditions of service are indispensable.

Serial No. 1910
The range of staff required will be wider than that required by the present Academy for Teacher Educators. The number of the different specialists will depend on the Ministry's priorities in key personnel training and on the degree to which this training is to be decentralized. The proposals in Appendices "C" "D", "E" and "F" provide a workable basis, but staff would almost certainly have to be strengthened, in a long-range project, in the fields of schools supervision and educational management and administration.

The problem of different sources of funds should be considered in regard to the structure of any new projects, and greater uniformity achieved. Two areas are concerned, equipment and personnel. Equipment supplied by UNDP, entirely under project control, presents far fewer administrative problems than UNICEF equipment, transferred to the local government. Experts on two-year contracts from UNDP give greater continuity and fewer administrative problems than those on one-year contracts from UNDP (Technical Assistance) or Unicef. The contribution of UNICEF to the present training project has been invaluable and should continue; but these administrative issues deserve consideration.

9. Alternative proposal - Unesco-assisted projects (after 1971)

If the government finds difficulty in accepting the recommendation given in paragraphs C.7 and 8 above, to which the mission gives the highest priority, another possibility would be to amalgamate, in one personnel training institution, all training activities in Kabul. This comprehensive institution would include:

The Academy for Teacher Educators with the new key personnel training functions as recommended in the preceding paragraph;

the Kabul DMA; and

the Kabul Higher Teachers' College.

The provincial training institutions would be in effect branches of this parent institution.

This organizational structure would have these advantages:

(a) Maximum flexibility in the use of accommodation, equipment and staff.

(b) Ease of co-ordination and control of training activities at all levels.

On the other hand, the following issues would have to be considered:

(a) Whether, as a matter of principle, primary and middle school teacher training, at the level of Grades 13 and 14, should be combined with key personnel training, which may be increasingly post-graduate;

(b) whether the establishment of such an institution would inhibit the ultimate role of the University in the Ministry's training programme;

(c) whether such an institution, which itself includes the teacher-training activities, would be as compatible with the development of provincial training institutions to meet provincial needs as the advisory structure, outlined in paragraph 8.
10. Unesco-assisted projects - fellowships. Policy and practice alike should be reviewed and clarified. Four areas are involved.

The purpose of these fellowships is interpreted variously. The primary purpose should be the acquisition of professional expertise required for the development of Afghan education, whether or not this results in the acquisition of a second degree by the individual.

Recognition of professional qualifications, as distinct from academic qualifications, by the government, is essential. It should be appreciated that, in the professional field, a post-graduate diploma may well be superior, for professional purposes, to a second degree. For example, a post-graduate diploma in applied linguistics or in second language teaching is of more professional use to a language specialist working in the teacher-training institutions than a simple Masters' degree in, say, English. Due recognition by the government of these diplomates, and a corresponding increase in their remuneration, should facilitate the development of a more satisfactory fellowship programme as recommended above.

It would be desirable to have greater flexibility in length of courses, but in practice this may result in fewer persons going on longer courses to acquire second degrees.

"Observation" courses are a problem. For individuals, these are of doubtful value. If shortage of qualified applicants makes such courses necessary, they should be grouped into viable units (6-10 Fellows in similar subject areas) and selected institutions asked to design specific study courses to meet their needs, leading to the award of an appropriate diploma.

In view of the complex nature of this question a visit by a senior Unesco official connected with the fellowship programme would be desirable.

11. Rationalization of Unesco-assisted projects - general

(a) It is strongly recommended that this be initiated as early as possible: by the transfer of function as recommended; by the provisional rearrangement of existing experts and posts between projects as indicated in Appendices "D", "E" and "F"; and by recruitment for vacant posts according to the needs of the new structure. Such action would not involve the provision of any additional funds.

(b) Because of the history of these projects, the attitudes that have developed within the projects, and the personalities involved, it is essential that the reorganization be carried out under the supervision of an individual who is not himself involved in any one of the projects. It is strongly recommended that the responsibility for carrying out the reorganization be entrusted to the present Chief of Mission, who is fully conversant with the projects and the problems involved.

(c) In order that the Unesco-assisted projects may become effective, certain measures on the part of the government are considered necessary, especially:

(i) The assignment to the projects of personnel of the required calibre, and,
(ii) improvement in the government's administrative procedures, not only to facilitate the early development of the projects as self-supporting institutions but also to facilitate their day-to-day operation, by granting them more autonomy and delegating authority to the assisted institutions within the general budget allocation.

12. **World Food Program (WFP) Aid.**

It is highly desirable that WFP aid to training institutions be maintained and even extended, to facilitate the further decentralization of the training activities of the Ministry of Education. This aid has so far been of great value in releasing funds for the expansion of teacher training in the provinces. If the expansion is to continue, in the present economic circumstances, further WFP aid is quite indispensable.
APPENDIX "A"

List of individuals met and institutions visited by the mission,
(excluding Unesco personnel, counterparts and faculty members met in
the course of visits)

Individuals

1. H.E. Dr. Abdul Qayum
   Minister of Education

2. H.E. Dr. Mahmoud Habibi
   Minister of Information and Culture

3. H.E. Ghulum Ali Ayeen
   Minister Without Portfolio

4. H.E. Shafiqa Zia Yee
   Minister Without Portfolio

5. H.E. Dr. Abdul Saifur Rahman Samady
   First Deputy Minister of Education

6. H.E. Mohammad Taher Ghaussi
   Second Deputy Minister of Education

7. H.E. Mohammad Khalid Roshan
   Deputy Minister of Information and Culture

8. Mr. Mohammad Ibrahim Shariffi
   General Director of Information

9. Mr. Sami Hameed
   President of the Teacher Education Department of the
   Ministry of Education

10. Dr. Mir Abdul Fath Siddique
    President of the Planning Department of the Ministry of Education

11. Mr. Habibullah Habib
    President of the Economic and Technical Co-operation Department of
    the Ministry of Planning

12. Dr. Mohammad Kareem Tawfique
    Director of the Audio-Visual Centre

13. Dr. Abdul Latiff Jalali
    Director of Radio Afghanistan

14. Mr. Zahir Aziz
    Secretary of the Afghan National Commission for Unesco

Serial No. 1910
15. Dr. Edwin L. Martin  
    Chief, Education Division USAID

16. Mr. Cecil Spearman  
    Chief of Party Teacher College Columbia University Team

17. Dr. Mitchel V. Owens  
    Chairman of Curriculum and Textbook Project

18. Mr. A. Shahbaz  
    Resident Representative, UNDP

19. Mr. W. Semerdjian  
    Assistant Resident Representative, UNDP

20. Mr. F.E. Joffre  
    Unicef Representative

21. Dr. E. von Schuh  
    World Food Progra Officer

**Institutions**

1. Academy for Teacher Educators, Kabul
2. Higher Teachers' College, Kabul
3. Primary Teachers' College, Kabul
4. Central Unit for Regional Educational Development, Kabul
5. Faculty of Education, Kabul University
6. Pilot Centre, Regional Educational Development, Kandahar
7. Primary Teachers' College, Kandahar
8. Higher Teachers' College, Kandahar
9. Primary and Middle Schools, Kandahar
10. Primary Teachers' College, Jalalabad
11. Primary Teachers' College, Charikar
13. Educational Broadcasting Section, Ministry of Education.

Serial No. 1910
Bibliography: Background and briefing material available to the mission

2. Aide-Mémoire of discussions between Director-General of Unesco and Minister of Education and Minister of Information and Culture, Afghanistan.
3. Briefing documents for visit of Director-General.
4. Plans of Operations for the Academy for Teacher Educators, Higher Teachers' College and the Regional Educational Development Programme, and job descriptions of the educational planning team.
5. Periodic reports on the projects.
6. Pamphlets, handbooks and miscellaneous documents produced by the projects.
8. Educational Planning and Economics of Education - O. Bertrand (Unesco).
13. Manpower and Education in Afghanistan (Ministry of Education, Kabul).
15. In-service Training of Teachers in Afghanistan (Ministry of Education, Kabul).
16. WFP reports on projects in Afghanistan.

Serial No. 1910
APPENDIX "C"

Proposed distribution of posts and personnel of the Educational Planning Team

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational Planning</td>
<td>Vacant. To be recruited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education</td>
<td>Holder to remain with Planning Team.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Education</td>
<td>Mission ends in July 1970. If extended, attach to FAO project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Broadcasting</td>
<td>Holder and post to be transferred to Department of Teacher Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women's Education</td>
<td>Mission ends in 1970</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additional posts required for new planning team

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational financing</td>
<td>In place of Adult Education post.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statistics</td>
<td>In place of former Women's Education post.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manpower Planning</td>
<td>Attachment of ILO expert.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Serial No. 1910
Proposed distribution of posts and personnel of the Regional Educational Development Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post</th>
<th>Holder</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chief Technical Adviser</td>
<td>(V. C. LINGREN)</td>
<td>(vid. para. 5 (a) (iv)).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Supervision</td>
<td>G. HVATTUM</td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and Vocational Guidance</td>
<td>J. SCHWEIGHOFER</td>
<td>Attach to Department of Guidance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Arts and Crafts</td>
<td>R. LEMOINE</td>
<td>Attach to Curriculum Project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio-Visual Aids</td>
<td>B. W. FRAMVIG</td>
<td>Attach to Audio-Visual Aids Centre.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science Teaching Aids</td>
<td>B. G. STENSLAND</td>
<td>Attach to Audio-Visual Aids Centre.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Adviser, Kandahar</td>
<td>A. A. SMITH</td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Adviser, Mazar</td>
<td>K. EYLING</td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist, Teacher Training</td>
<td>F. SAYED</td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-service Teacher Training</td>
<td>S. SHARMA</td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Assistant</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Regional Educational Development Programme)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer to Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary 2 (vacant)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer to Planning Team.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Serial No. 1910
## APPENDIX "E"

### Proposed distribution of posts and personnel in the Academy for Teacher Educators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post</th>
<th>Holder</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chief Technical Adviser</td>
<td>C.J. ALLEN</td>
<td>Post remains with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Kabul (2)</td>
<td>R. BOUYEZ, R. SIVERTSEN</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Gardez</td>
<td>A. JONES</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Herat</td>
<td>F. HARLEY</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Jalalabad</td>
<td>M. EL-SAYED</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Charikar</td>
<td>H. LAWRENCE</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Teacher Training Adviser, Kunduz</td>
<td>E. EDUALINO</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies and Language Teaching Methods</td>
<td>A. MURRAY</td>
<td>Remain with revised Academy for Teacher Educators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science Teaching Methods (Rural Science)</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
<td>Transfer to Planning Team (Financing of Education)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science Teaching Methods (General Science and Mathematics)</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
<td>Remain with Academy for Teacher Educators, and recruit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principles of Teaching</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
<td>Remain with Academy for Teacher Educators, and recruit.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Serial No. 1910
## APPENDIX "F"

**Proposed distribution of posts and personnel in Higher Teachers' College**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post</th>
<th>Holder</th>
<th>Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Biology/Chemistry (Senior Expert)</td>
<td>C.C. ROBERTS</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Teaching</td>
<td>F.G. LEAROYD</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics/Mathematics</td>
<td>M.B. PROKOPYEV</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principles of Education</td>
<td>G. TSUDA</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Librarianship</td>
<td>E. REID-SMITH</td>
<td>Transfer to revised Academy for Teacher Educators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies</td>
<td>R. ZELECH</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension Department</td>
<td>W. MATHESON</td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Assistant</td>
<td></td>
<td>Remain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Serial No. 1910